



**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES  
2<sup>ND</sup> FLOOR, CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
CITY HALL BUILDING, TWO CIVIC CENTER PLAZA  
MARCH 26, 2012  
4:00 P.M.**

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the City Council Chambers, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, City Hall Building, March 26, 2012, 4:00 p.m.

Chair Riccillo called the meeting to order at 4:10 p.m.

The following Commissioners were present:

Commissioner Joe Riccillo, Chair  
Commissioner Ricardo Gonzalez, Vice-Chair  
Commissioner Joel Guzman  
Commissioner Jim Booher  
Commissioner David Berchelmann

The following City Staff were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Planning, Historic Preservation Officer  
Ms. Sol Cortez, City Attorney's Office, Assistant City Attorney  
Ms. Kristen L. Hamilton, City Attorney's Office, Assistant City Attorney

**I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT**

*None*

**CHANGES TO THE AGENDA**

*There were no changes to the agenda.*



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



**MOTION:**

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Guzman and  
**UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE AGENDA AS IT STANDS.**

**II. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION**

**Certificate of Appropriateness**

1.    **PHAP12-00004:**                      The East ½ of Lot 28, plus all of Lots 29-31 save and except a portion of lot 31, Block 4, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location:                                      3257 Aurora
- Historic District:                            Manhattan Heights
- Property Owner:                            Victor Duran
- Representative:                            Victor Duran
- Representative District:                2
- Existing Zoning:                            R-3/H (Residential/Historic)
- Year Built:                                    1953
- Historic Status:                            Non-contributing
- Request:                                      Certificate of appropriateness for a new addition.
- Application Filed:                        3/8/2012
- 45 Day Expiration:                        4/23/2012

Ms. Velázquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and stated the Historic Preservation Office recommends APPROVAL of the proposed scope of work, with modifications\*, based on the following recommendations:

*The Magoffin Historic District Design Guidelines* recommend the following:

- New additions should be planned so that they are constructed to the rear of the property or on a non-character defining elevation.
- Start a new addition on the side or rear of a building.



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



- Additions should complement the original structure but not necessarily attempt to duplicate or copy it. The older structure should be identifiable from the addition.

*The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* recommend the following:

- New additions will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.
- The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

- \* *Modification – The new addition shall be set back from the main façade of the existing building by one or two feet.*

The following Commissioners and Staff commented and/or asked questions:

1. Commissioner Booher
2. Ms. Velázquez clarified only the Downtown Historic District acknowledges that there is a difference in the way we treat contributing/non-contributing properties; all other Historic Districts do not have that distinction at all.
3. Chair Riccillo
4. Commissioner Berchelmann
5. Commissioner Guzman
6. Vice-Chair Gonzalez

No further questions and/or comments from Commissioners.

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027



**MOTION:**

Motion made by Commissioner Booher **TO APPROVE WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT THE FAÇADE OF THE ADDITION WOULD BE OFFSET ONE TO TWO FEET FROM THE MAIN FAÇADE OF THE EXISTING BUILDING TO DIFFERENTIATE THE OLD AND THE NEW.**

Chair Riccillo clarified that staff has requested the property owner match the color and material.

**AMENDED MOTION:**

Motion made by Commissioner Booher, seconded by Chair Riccillo and **UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE PENDING A REVISION AS RECOMMENDED BY THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER AND STAFF RELATIVE TO THE FAÇADE WHEREBY THE NEW ADDITION WOULD BE OFFSET TO DIFFERENTIATE IT FROM THE EXISTING STRUCTURE.**

2. **PHAP12-00005:** San Antonio Street, Right of Way, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: San Antonio Street from El Paso Street to Florence Street
- Historic District: Downtown
- Property Owner: City of El Paso
- Representative: Gilbert Guerrero
- Representative District: 8
- Existing Zoning: C-5/H (Central Business District/Historic)
- Year Built: N/A
- Historic Status: Non-contributing
- Request: Certificate of appropriateness for right of way improvements
- Application Filed: 3/08/12



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



45 Day Expiration: 4/23/12

Ms. Velázquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and explained some portions of the request are not located within the Downtown Historic District. Ms. Velázquez noted the request is for Right of Way improvements. Improvements include:

1. Landscaping;
2. Installation of stamped concrete;
3. Brick pattern in the street;
4. Installation of benches;
5. Installation of kiosks and medallions (not part of the proposal at this time); and
6. Sidewalk and area improvements

The Historic Preservation Office recommends APPROVAL of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

*The Downtown Design Guidelines* recommend the following:

- Sidewalks should be enhanced by installing brick pavers (or other decorative materials) along the edges and/or intersections.
- Existing planting boxes should be removed. Instead trees with tree grates should be installed.
- All sidewalks should have handicap accessibility.
- Trees should have tree grates and vertical tree guards similar to those at Pioneer Plaza.
- Street furniture should be consistent with the character of the historic landmarks within the district.
- Street furniture should be selected, placed and maintained as part of the overall design scheme.

*The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* recommend the following:

- Identifying, retaining, and preserving features of the site that are important in



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson





defining its overall historic character.

The following Commissioners and Staff commented and/or asked questions:

1. Vice-Chair Gonzalez
2. Ms. Velázquez explained the kiosks and medallions are not part of this proposal; however, because they are shown in the drawings, they were included in the presentation. Commissioners could:
  - a. *Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the kiosks and medallions; or*
  - b. *Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness without the kiosks and medallions and request that they be brought before the Commission at the time the City is ready to present them.*
3. Chair Riccillo
4. Commissioner Berchermann
5. Commissioner Guzman prefers stamped concrete that looks like brick.
6. Mr. Gilbert Guerrero, Project Manager, Engineering & Construction Management explained the stamped concrete at the intersection will be a weave type design. For the sidewalks, the design for the stamped concrete will be a brick-like pattern. Brick design stamped concrete is cost effective, looks better and does not crumble like regular brick. Because some of the kiosks will be lighted, E&C Staff wanted to include the underground conduit at this time. There are several Electric Company vaults and basements; however, E&C Staff does not anticipate any basement reconstruction.

No further questions and/or comments from Commissioners.

Chair Riccillo explained Commissioners could request staff review the kiosks and medallions administratively.

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027



**MOTION:**

Motion made by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Commissioner Berchermann and **UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE DESIGN SUBMITTED, REGARDING THE KIOSKS AND PATHWAY MEDALLIONS, DEFER THOSE FOR ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVAL THROUGH THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER.**

3. Addresses of property HLC Commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, Commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. March 26, 2012 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the April 9, 2012 meeting. April 9, 2012 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the April 23, 2012 meeting.

*Chair Riccillo noted that today was the deadline for HLC members to add properties for the next meeting; additionally, the next meeting is the deadline for the following meeting.*

**A. Fall Mansion at 1725 Arizona Avenue**

Ms. Velázquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and explained the restoration project is near completion and the City is talking to prospective tenants.

The following commented:

1. Chair Riccillo
2. Vice-Chair Gonzalez
3. Commissioner Guzman referred to a recently published newspaper article in the El Paso, Inc. regarding the columns and the distinction between the Ionic columns capitol.



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**  
John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*  
Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*  
Susie Byrd

*District 3*  
Emma Acosta

*District 4*  
Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*  
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*  
Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*  
Steve Ortega

*District 8*  
Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**  
Joyce A. Wilson



4. Ms. Velázquez gave background information regarding the Ionic columns.
5. Commissioner Berchermann
6. Commissioner Booher

**B. El Paso High School**

Ms. Velázquez explained El Paso High School is on the National Register; however, the property is not locally designated as a historic site and does not have an H-Overlay. Because the property is listed on the National Register, in the past, the property owner requested a Certificate of Appropriateness for any work done on the property. Ms. Velázquez was unsure if that was an Agreement between the City of El Paso and the property owner. To designate the property with an H-Overlay would cost between \$25,000 and \$30,000, approximately. When proposing any changes to the structure, the property owner has been diligent in coming to the Historic Preservation staff for review and approval.

The following commented:

1. Chair Riccillo requested Staff research whether or not there is an Agreement, or some type of document, whereby the property owner must apply for a Certificate of Appropriateness. Additionally, he requested staff requested whether or not an existing Agreement prevents the Historic Landmark Commission from spending any monies.
2. Ms. Velázquez confirmed the property is listed on the National Register. Staff will continue to research information on the property.
3. Vice-Chair Gonzalez

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027





**HLC Staff Report**

4. Update on Administrative Review Cases since the last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda.  
(See Attachment "A")

Vice-Chair Gonzalez wondered if the property located at 3200 Wheeling was Crockett Elementary School. Additionally, he wondered if the new wall would be located in the same location and constructed in the same design as the previous.

Ms. Velázquez responded yes and provided additional information regarding the request to replace the existing retaining wall.

**Planning & Economic Development Department Reports**

5. None.

**Visionaries in Preservation Report**

6. None.

**Other Business**

7. **A.** Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for February 27, 2012.

Chair Riccillo asked Commissioners if they had any additions/corrections/revisions. There being none.

**MOTION:**

Motion made by Commissioner Berchelmann, seconded by Chair Riccillo and  
**UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE REGULAR MEETING  
MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 27, 2012.**



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



**B. Discussion on the Downtown Historic District Design Guidelines.**

Ms. Velázquez explained she will be attending the Wednesday, March 28, 12:00 p.m., Downtown Management District Board meeting to discuss the Downtown Historic District Design Guidelines. Commissioners are invited to attend. Staff is proposing to reevaluate some of the non-contributing properties, in addition, ensuring whether or not the non-contributing properties must follow the Design Guidelines. Ms. Velázquez stated that, prior to bringing the revised Guidelines to Commissioners, staff wants to hear what the property owners have to say. She will update Commissioners regarding the outcome of the Downtown Management District Board Meeting at the next HLC meeting and distribute copies of the revised Downtown Historic District Design Guidelines.

**C. Discussion and action regarding contributing versus non-contributing properties in the Downtown Historic District.**

At this time, Ms. Sol Cortez, Assistant City Attorney introduced Ms. Kristin Hamilton, Assistant City Attorney, and Legal Counsel for the Historic Landmark Commission.

The following commented:

1. Ms. Cortez stated, as far as she was aware, there is no new information
2. Chair Riccillo explained Commissioners and staff have discussed contributing and non-contributing properties and which portions of the Guidelines apply, for quite some time. Due to the H-Overlay, it should not matter if the property is contributing or non-contributing, they should come before the Commission just like all other H-Overlay Historic Districts. Commissioners are requesting information, i.e., an ordinance, explaining why the Downtown Historic District is different and excludes non-contributing properties.



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



3. Ms. Hamilton was made aware of the issue and stated she does have a copy of the ordinance which stipulates that non-contributing properties do not come before the Commission.
  4. Chair Riccillo responded that the ordinance discusses applicable Design Guidelines, not Certificates of Appropriateness.
  5. Ms. Cortez replied Commissioners can always change the ordinance language.
  6. Vice-Chair Gonzalez clarified the City of El Paso has zoned the Downtown Historic District with Historic Overlay (H-Overlay). The HLC ordinance states that H-Overlay properties must come before the HLC. The only distinction between the Downtown Historic District and the other historic districts is that non-contributing properties are exempt from the Guidelines, not from the ordinance.
  7. Commissioner Guzman felt there are so many downtown buildings in such poor condition that Commissioners are prohibiting economic growth by enforcing these standards.
  8. Vice-Chair Riccillo disagreed with Commissioner Guzman's comment and explained Commissioners are only requesting that the façade maintain its integrity.
- D. Discussion and action placing an H-Overlay on the property located at 800 East Schuster Drive, El Paso High School.

See page 8, item 3B.

-----



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



**AGENDA ITEM FOR NEXT HLC MEETING**

Chair Riccillo noted that the April 9<sup>th</sup> HLC meeting would be his last meeting. He requested Staff place an item on the agenda regarding the nomination of a new HLC Chair.

Ms. Velázquez will research the issue.

*No further business from Commissioners.*

**MOTION:**

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Booher and **UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING AT 4:54 P.M.**

**Mayor**

John F. Cook

**City Council**

*District 1*

Ann Morgan Lilly

*District 2*

Susie Byrd

*District 3*

Emma Acosta

*District 4*

Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*

Eddie Holguin Jr.

*District 7*

Steve Ortega

*District 8*

Cortney Carlisle Niland

**City Manager**

Joyce A. Wilson



Two Civic Center Plaza  
El Paso, TX 79901  
(915) 541-4027